

1 Robert W. Boatman (009619) - rwb@gknet.com
2 Paul L. Stoller (016773) - paul.stoller@gknet.com
3 Shannon L. Clark (019708) - SLC@gknet.com
4 **GALLAGHER & KENNEDY, P.A.**
5 2575 East Camelback Road
6 Phoenix, Arizona 85016-9225
7 Telephone: (602) 530-8000

8 Ramon Rossi Lopez (CA Bar No. 86361)
9 (admitted *pro hac vice*)
10 **LOPEZ McHUGH LLP**
11 100 Bayview Circle, Suite 5600
12 Newport Beach, California 92660
13 rlopez@lopezmchugh.com

14 *Co-Lead/Liaison Counsel for Plaintiffs*

15
16 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
17 **FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

18 **IN RE: BARD IVC FILTERS**
19 **PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION**

20 MD No. 02641

21 **PARTIES' JOINT REPORT ON ESI**
22 **PROTOCOL AND JOINT REQUEST**
23 **TO EXTEND TIME TO SUBMIT**
24 **PROTOCOL**

25 In accordance with this Court's October 30, 2015 Case Management Order No. 2,
26 the Parties submit this joint report with respect to the creation of an ESI Protocol for this
27 MDL. The Parties have not yet reached agreement on a form of ESI protocol but continue
28 to work cooperatively in an effort to do so. Because the Parties continue to engage in a
cooperative effort to produce an ESI Protocol they jointly request that the Court extend
the time for the Parties to submit an ESI Protocol addressing format of production,
preservation, and other relevant ESI-discovery or a joint report setting forth the areas of
agreement and disagreement and recommending a procedure for resolving disagreements.

29 **REPORT AND REQUEST FOR EXTENSION**

30 Following on the initial case management conference and this Courts' Case
31 Management Order No. 2, counsel for plaintiffs and defendants have engaged in a series
32 of conversations and communications regarding ESI in this matter. Counsel for plaintiffs

1 has requested information regarding defendants' information systems, ESI preservation,
2 and ESI collection as foundation to understand defendants' prior ESI review and
3 productions. Defendants have produced documents, prior testimony, as well as
4 correspondence from prior actions to address some of these requests. Counsel for
5 plaintiffs has reviewed that information and asked for additional information from
6 defendants. The Parties anticipate continued cooperation to provide information and to
7 answer questions regarding plaintiffs' and defendants' collection, preservation, and search
8 methods in order to come to an agreed ESI Protocol. In light of the intervening holidays,
9 the Parties request an extension to January 15, 2016 to do so.

10 In particular, the Parties request that the Court extend to January 15, 2016 the
11 Parties' deadline to jointly present to the Court an ESI Protocol addressing format of
12 production, preservation, and other relevant ESI-discovery or, if the parties are unable to
13 reach agreement on all aspects of the ESI Protocol, to file a joint report setting forth the
14 areas of agreement and disagreement and recommending a procedure for resolving
15 disagreements in accordance with Case Management Order No. 2. The Parties have
16 submitted a proposed form of Order with this joint report and request for extension.

17 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 30th day of November 2015.

GALLAGHER & KENNEDY, P.A.

20 By: /s/ Robert W. Boatman
21 Robert W. Boatman
22 Paul L. Stoller
Shannon L. Clark
2575 E. Camelback Road, Suite 1100
Phoenix, Arizona 85016-9225

LOPEZ McHUGH LLP

Ramon Rossi Lopez (CA Bar No. 86361)
(admitted *pro hac vice*)
100 Bayview Circle, Suite 5600
Newport Beach, California 92660

Co-Lead/Liaison Counsel for Plaintiffs

SNELL & WILMER

By: /s/ Matthew Lerner [with permission]

James R. Condo

Amanda C. Sheridan

One Arizona Center

400 E. Van Buren

Phoenix, Arizona

Richard B. North, Jr. (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Georgia Bar No. 545599
Matthew B. Lerner (admitted *pro hac vice*)

Matthew B. Lerner (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Georgia Bar No. 446086

Georgia Bar No. 446986
Nelson Mullins Riley 8

Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP
201 17th Street, NW / Suite 1700

201 17th Street, NW / Suite 1700
Atlanta, GA 30363

Atlanta, GA 30363

6. \mathbf{D}_1 (6 = 1)

*Attorneys for Defendants C. R. Bard, Inc. and
Bard Peripheral Vascular, Inc.*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 30th day of November, 2015, I electronically transmitted the attached document to the Clerk's Office using the CM/ECF System for filing and transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing.

/s/ Nancy Jo Koenes
Nancy Jo Koenes

5147099v1/26997-0001